

ARTICLE

https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-20356-0

OPEN



Important contributions of non-fossil fuel nitrogen oxides emissions

Wei Song¹, Xue-Yan Liu[®] ^{1⊠}, Chao-Chen Hu¹, Guan-Yi Chen[®] ², Xue-Jun Liu[®] ³, Wendell W. Walters⁴, Greg Michalski⁵ & Cong-Qiang Liu¹

Since the industrial revolution, it has been assumed that fossil-fuel combustions dominate increasing nitrogen oxide (NO_x) emissions. However, it remains uncertain to the actual contribution of the non-fossil fuel NO_x to total NO_x emissions. Natural N isotopes of NO₃⁻ in precipitation ($\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$) have been widely employed for tracing atmospheric NO_x sources. Here, we compiled global $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ observations to evaluate the relative importance of fossil and non-fossil fuel NO_x emissions. We found that regional differences in human activities directly influenced spatial-temporal patterns of $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ variations. Further, isotope mass-balance and bottom-up calculations suggest that the non-fossil fuel NO_x accounts for 55 ± 7% of total NO_x emissions, reaching up to 21.6 ± 16.6Mt yr⁻¹ in East Asia, 7.4 ± 5.5Mt yr⁻¹ in Europe, and 21.8 ± 18.5Mt yr⁻¹ in North America, respectively. These results reveal the importance of non-fossil fuel NO_x emissions and provide direct evidence for making strategies on mitigating atmospheric NO_x pollution.

¹ School of Earth System Science, Tianjin University, 300072 Tianjin, China. ² Georgia Tech Shenzhen Institute, Tianjin University, 518071 Shenzhen, China. ³ College of Resources and Environmental Sciences, China Agricultural University, 100193 Beijing, China. ⁴ Institute at Brown for Environment and Society, Brown University, 85 Waterman St, Providence, RI 02912, USA. ⁵ Department of Earth, Atmospheric, and Planetary Sciences, Purdue University, 550 Stadium Mall Drive, West Lafayette, IN 47907, USA. ⁵⁸ email: liuxueyan@tju.edu.cn

ver past decades, both concentrations and deposition fluxes of nitrogen oxides (NO_x), nitric acid (HNO₃), and nitrate (NO_3^{-}) in the atmosphere have been remarkably elevated in many regions of the world¹⁻⁴. This has caused negative effects on the environmental quality (e.g., haze, eutrophication), human health (e.g., respiratory and cardiovascular diseases, acute bronchitis), and the structure and functions of ecosystems (e.g., soil acidification, biodiversity losses)^{5,6}. Gaseous NO_{r_2} the sum of N oxide (NO) and N dioxide (NO₂), is the precursor of atmospherically deposited NO3-7,8 and mainly emitted from fossil fuel combustion (primarily via coal combustion and vehicle exhausts) and non-fossil fuel sources including biomass burning, microbial N cycles in soils and animal wastes⁹. Accurate differentiation of NO_x emissions from fossil-fuel and non-fossil emission sectors is pivotal for regulatory action to mitigate emissions, budget NO₃⁻ deposition fluxes, and model ecological and climatic effects of atmospheric NO₃⁻ loading.

It is feasible to estimate fossil fuel NO_x emissions according to known consumption amounts of fossil fuels and their NO_x emission factors¹⁰⁻¹². More often, fossil fuel NO_x emissions in many countries have been recorded in national statistics yearbooks and emission inventories^{2,12-15}. Since the 1990s, fossil fuel NO_x emissions have accounted for 95% of global NO_x emissions¹¹, 90% of NO_x emissions in Europe², 88% of NO_x emissions in East Asia¹⁰, and 96% of NO_x emissions in North America^{14,15}. In contrast, the importance and amount of non-fossil fuel NO_x emissions remain unclear due to the difficulties in obtaining their emission factors and amounts. Particularly, it is almost impossible to budget NO_x emission amounts from diverse biomass burnings and microbial N cycles that occur in different solid- and liquidphase substrates¹⁶⁻¹⁸. In many cases, data of emission factors and estimates of emission budgets were rather incomplete and even unrecorded for non-fossil fuel NOx.

However, according to the simulation results of atmospheric chemical transport and terrestrial ecosystem models, biomass burning and soil emissions account for about 20% and 22% of global NO_x emissions, respectively^{19–21}. The combination of a bottom-up spatial model and top-down airborne observations of atmospheric NO_x concentrations through satellite imagery pointed to a significant and overlooked NO_x emission from cropland soils, which constitutes 20-51% of the total NO_x budget at the regional scale²². Recently, natural stable N isotopes (expressed as $\delta^{15}N$, $\delta^{15}N = ({}^{15}N/{}^{14}N)_{sample}/({}^{15}N/{}^{14}N)_{standard} - 1$, where atmospheric N2 is used as the internationally recognized N isotopic standard) have been widely employed for tracking NO_x emissions^{7,23-25}. Isotopic investigations have demonstrated that NO_x from biomass burning and microbial N cycle may account for more than 40% of NO3- in particulates and precipitation collected in urban sites of China^{26,27}. In summary, we argue that the importance of non-fossil fuel NO_x is still an open question.

NO is the most initial form of fossil fuel and non-fossil fuel NO_x emissions, but NO is normally insoluble and will be rapidly oxidized to NO₂ in the atmosphere, forming the photochemical NO_x cycle²⁸. The mixing of fossil fuel and non-fossil fuel NO_x emissions forms the initial NO_x pool in the atmosphere (i-NO_x) (Supplementary Fig. 1). In reality, it is extremely difficult if not impossible to directly measure the i-NO_x pool due to instantaneous emissions and oxidations. However, the $\delta^{15}N$ of the i-NO_x (i.e., $\delta^{15}N_{i-NOx}$) is a straightforward parameter to integrate initial NO_x emissions and thus to differentiate relative contributions between fossil and non-fossil fuel NO_x emissions^{26,27}. In the atmosphere, the i-NO_x is partially oxidized to HNO₃ and particulate NO₃⁻ (p-NO₃⁻) (Supplementary Fig. 1), during which N isotopic fractionations^{29,30} lead to substantial δ^{15} N differences between ambient NO_x, HNO₃, and p-NO₃⁻. Because of the difficulty in constraining δ^{15} N differences among these species, it remains a big challenge to evaluate i-NO_x sources based on δ^{15} N signatures of ambient NO_x, HNO₃, and p-NO₃⁻. However, precipitation can scavenge both the ambient NO₂ and the oxidized NO₂ (i.e., HNO₃ and p-NO₃⁻) (Supplementary Fig. 1)³¹. Therefore, we can reconstruct the corresponding δ^{15} N_{i-NOx} values of the observed δ^{15} N_{w-NO3}⁻ values (Supplementary Figs. 1, 2). Assuming that the estimated δ^{15} N_{i-NOx} value represents and integrates the emission δ^{15} N_{i-NOx} value, we can differentiate relative contributions between fossil fuel and non-fossil fuel NO_x emissions^{7,24,32}.

Based on the above isotope theory, the $\delta^{15}N_{i-NOx}$ value can be estimated by the following equation (Eq. (1)):

$$\begin{split} \delta^{15} \mathbf{N}_{\mathrm{i-NOx}} &= (\delta^{15} \mathbf{N}_{\mathrm{NOx}} \times \mathbf{C}_{\mathrm{NO2}} / f_{\mathrm{NO2}} + \delta^{15} \mathbf{N}_{\mathrm{HNO3}} \times \mathbf{C}_{\mathrm{HNO3}} + \delta^{15} N_{\mathrm{p-NO3-}} \times \mathbf{C}_{\mathrm{p-NO3-}}) / \\ & (\mathbf{C}_{\mathrm{NO2}} / f_{\mathrm{NO2}} + \mathbf{C}_{\mathrm{HNO3}} + \mathbf{C}_{\mathrm{p-NO3-}}), \end{split}$$

(1)

where C_{NO2} , C_{HNO3} , and C_{p-NO3-} are concentrations of ambient NO₂, HNO₃, and p-NO₃⁻ in the atmosphere, respectively. f_{NO2} is the fraction of NO₂ in NO_x. $\delta^{15}N_{NO2x}$, $\delta^{15}N_{HNO3}$, and $\delta^{15}N_{p-NO3-}$ are $\delta^{15}N$ values of NO_x, HNO₃, and p-NO₃⁻ in the atmosphere, respectively. The values used for C_{NO2} , C_{HNO3} , C_{p-NO3-} , f_{NO2} , $\delta^{15}N_{NOx}$, $\delta^{15}N_{HNO3}$, and $\delta^{15}N_{p-NO3-}$ are listed in Supplementary Table 1. Due to the limited availability of f_{NO2} and $\delta^{15}N_{NOx}$ values, global mean values were used in our calculations ($f_{NO2} = 64 \pm 10\%$, and $\delta^{15}N_{NOx} = -7.7 \pm 2.9\%$) (Supplementary Table 1).

To investigate the importance of non-fossil fuel NO_x emissions to total NO_x emissions, we compiled available δ^{15} N values of NO_3^- in precipitation (denoted as $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ hereafter) at urban and non-urban sites of East Asia, Europe, and North America (detailed in "Methods") (Fig. 1). Both the concentrations and $\delta^{15}N$ values of ambient NO_{x2} HNO₃, and p-NO₃⁻ were used to constrain the δ^{15} N values of the initial mixture of fossil fuel and nonfossil fuel NO_x in the atmosphere (denoted as $\delta^{15}N_{i-NOx}$ detailed in "Methods") (Supplementary Fig. 1). Then we evaluated the differences between $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ and $\delta^{15}N_{i-NOx}$ values (denoted as $^{15}\Delta_{i-NOx \to w-NO3-}$, $^{15}\Delta_{i-NOx \to w-NO3-} = \delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ - $\delta^{15}N_{i-NOx}$ detailed in "Methods"). By combining the ${}^{15}\Delta_{i-NOX \rightarrow W-NO3-}$ values (Supplementary Fig. 2), the observed $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ values, and δ^{15} N values of dominant fossil fuel and non-fossil fuel NO_x sources (Supplementary Figs. 3, 13), we calculated relative contributions of dominant fossil fuel and non-fossil fuel NO_x by using a statistical isotope mass-balance model.

Results and discussion

Spatial and temporal variations of $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ values. In general, East Asia has significantly higher $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ values (1.7 ± 5.4‰ at urban sites and $0.3 \pm 3.1\%$ at non-urban sites) than Europe $(0.8 \pm 2.6\%)$ and $-1.5 \pm 2.6\%$, respectively) and North America $(-0.5 \pm 1.9\%)$ and $-1.9 \pm 2.1\%$, respectively) (Fig. 2). This result reflects more influences of the ¹⁵N-enriched NO_x from coal combustion ($\delta^{15}N = 13.7 \pm 3.9\%$; Supplementary Fig. 3) in East Asia than in the other two study regions. Supportively, the amount of coal consumption in East Asia accounted for about 55% of the world's total amount during 1965-2015, even up to about 64% during 1990-2015 (Supplementary Fig. 4a). Moreover, the NO_x from coal combustion has influenced $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ signatures of both urban and non-urban areas in East Asia, so that $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ values did not differ between urban and non-urban sites (Fig. 2). The $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ values are lower at non-urban sites than at urban sites in Europe and North America (Fig. 2), reflecting more influences of the ¹⁵N-depleted NO_x from microbial N cycle (δ^{15} N = $-30.2 \pm 6.7\%$; Supplementary Fig. 3) at non-urban sites of these two regions than that of East Asia.



Fig. 1 Study sites with $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ observations. Red, blue, and black dots represent urban sites (n = 56), non-urban sites (n = 158), and Arctic sites (n = 8), respectively.



Fig. 2 δ^{15} N_{w-NO3-} values at urban and non-urban sites of East Asia (n = 25 and n = 38, respectively), Europe (n = 8 and n = 15, respectively), and North America (n = 10 and n = 73, respectively). Dots show mean values of replicate measurements at each site. The box encompasses the 25th-75th percentiles, whiskers, and line in each box are the SD and mean values, respectively. The symbol of * indicates differences between urban and non-urban sites. n.s.: not significant. Different letters indicate differences among East Asia, Europe, and North America. The significance level was set at P < 0.1.

The three study regions exhibit different temporal variations in $\delta^{15}N_{w\text{-}NO3-}$ values (Fig. 3). In East Asia, $\delta^{15}N_{w\text{-}NO3-}$ values increased at both urban and non-urban sites from 2000 to 2007 and then decreased very slowly (Fig. 3). This trend reflects the controlling strategies of NOx emissions from coal combustion in East Asia, particularly in China. During 2000-2007, the amount of coal consumption in China accounts for $89 \pm 2\%$ of the total amount in East Asia (Supplementary Fig. 4b). As a turning point, China started to implement mitigation measures for NO_x from coal combustion in 2007, i.e., the policy of "replacing small generation units with large ones" for coal power plants^{33,34}. Since 2008, a largescale flue gas denitrification technology has been widely utilized in coal-fired power plants of China to reduce the NO_x emission from industrial coal combustion^{33,35}. Differently, $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ values in Europe decreased from 2002 to 2017 (Fig. 3) in response to a decrease in NO_x emissions from the coal combustion because the coal consumption in Europe has reduced by 20% from 2002 to 2017 (Supplementary Fig. 4a). Although there was a significant decrease in the amount of coal combustion (by 34%) in North America during 2000–2017 (Supplementary Fig. 4a), corresponding $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ values were relatively consistent (Fig. 3). This pattern reflects the NO_x emission reduction technology used in power plants because the technology can raise δ^{15} N values of NO_x emitted³⁶.

Importance of non-fossil fuel NO_x emissions. Results from the Stable Isotope Analysis in R (the SIAR model; detailed in "Methods") showed that variations in relative contributions of NO_x from coal combustion are the main cause of different temporal patterns of regional $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ variations. (Supplementary Figs. 5–8).



Fig. 3 Variations of $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ values during 2000-2017. a, b Urban and non-urban sites of East Asia. c, d Urban and non-urban sites of Europe. e, f Urban and non-urban sites of North America. Mean values of replicate measurements at each site in each year are shown. The gray lines are the 95% confidence intervals.

However, relative contributions of non-fossil fuel NO_x emissions average $49 \pm 11\%$ at urban sites and $69 \pm 13\%$ at non-urban sites for all three study regions (Supplementary Fig. 9). By integrating urban and non-urban sites in each region, we found that relative contributions of non-fossil fuel NO_x average 57 \pm 13% in East Asia, 54 \pm 13% in Europe, and 53±13% in North America (Fig. 4a, Supplementary Fig. 9). Based on mean annual emission amounts of NO_x from coal combustion and vehicle exhausts (Fig. 4b, Supplementary Fig. 10) and their annual mean relative contributions to total NO_x emissions (Fig. 4a), the mean annual NO_x emissions are estimated (detailed in "Methods") at 37.9 ± 16.4 Mt yr⁻¹ in East Asia during 2000-2016, $13.7 \pm 5.6 \text{Mt yr}^{-1}$ in Europe during 2000-2017, and 41.1 ± 18.8 Mt yr⁻¹ in North America during 2000–2015, respectively (Fig. 4b). Then, non-fossil fuel NO_x emission has been determined at 21.6 ± 16.6 Mt yr⁻¹ in East Asia, 7.4 ± 5.5 Mt yr⁻¹ in Europe, and 21.8 ± 18.5 Mt yr⁻¹ in North America, respectively (Fig. 4b). These values for regional NO_x emissions are valuable because they have long been missing in budgeting NO_x deposition and modeling effects of atmospheric NO_x loading.

Although we have considered uncertainties, there are still a few factors that remain difficult to quantify in the current stage. First, not all NO_x emission sources have been considered in δ^{15} N observations, and other sources such as natural gases and oil fuel combustion might be important in a few sites. Second, data heterogeneities in time and space are also a source of uncertainty, as it is almost impossible to measure the parameters used in our calculations simultaneously. Furthermore, the SIAR model only provides possible distributions but not definitive solutions of relative contributions of multiple sources. Therefore, future efforts on constraining these uncertainties will improve natural isotope evidence on global NO_x emissions.

Remarks. Our study provides direct isotope evidence on that the changes in regional human activities have distinct influences on δ^{15} N signatures of deposited NO_x to terrestrial environments.



Fig. 4 Fossil and non-fossil fuel NO_x emissions in East Asia, Europe, and North America. a Relative contributions. b Emission amounts. Mean \pm SD values are shown.

The $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ values exhibit significant spatiotemporal changes, which can be used to trace anthropogenic N inputs and help us understand decadal $\delta^{15}N$ variations in materials of surface-earth systems, such as tree rings, sediments, and oceanic biota. Currently, environmental policies in many countries of the study regions mostly aim to mitigate more fossil fuel NO_x emissions via technology promotion and energy structure adjustment. However, our study shows that non-fossil fuel NO_x emission is equally as important as fossil fuel NO_x emission, and it has long been underestimated. Accordingly, the control of nonfossil fuel NO_x emissions should be equally considered in the mitigation of NO_x pollution. Moreover, regional NO_x emissions newly constrained in this study are useful for budgeting NO₃⁻ deposition fluxes and modeling ecological and climatic effects of atmospheric NO₃⁻ loading.

Methods

Global $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ observations. Publications of $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ studies were obtained through the databases of the Web of Science (http://isiknowledge.com), Google Scholar (http://scholar.google.com.hk), and Baidu Scholar (http://xueshu.baidu.com) by searching keywords of "nitrogen isotope", "nitrate", "rainfall", and "precipitation". By the end of December 2018, a total of 128 publications were available (Supplementary Text 1), spanning the sampling time of 1956–2017 (Supplementary Fig. 11). We extracted $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ values of individual precipitation samples by using the software of Web Plot Digitizer³⁷.

There are totally 3483 individual $\delta^{15}N_{w\cdot NO3-}$ data and 222 sampling sites when multiple observations in different sampling years at the same site were counted once only (Fig. 1). There are 56 urban sites, 158 non-urban sites, and eight arctic sites (Fig. 1), in which non-urban sites are mainly situated in rural, mountain, forest, and lake areas. Due to the sparsity of available data before 2000 (Supplementary Fig. 11), we analyzed $\delta^{15}N_{w\cdot NO3-}$ data at major urban and nonurban sites in East Asia, Europe, and North America during 2000-2017 to ensure a better site representation and to reduce the uncertainty caused by inconsistency in sampling time (Fig. 1). To describe spatial differences in $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ values between urban and non-urban sites among three regions (totally 214 sites), only site-based mean values during the period of 2000-2017 (totally 169 sites) were used (detailed in Fig. 2). To describe temporal variations of $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ values in urban and non-urban areas of each region, respectively (Fig. 3), we counted observation sites by different sampling years, given that $\delta^{15}N_{w\text{-}NO3-}$ observations at few sites have been conducted in different sampling years. In this way, there were a total of 206 sites during 2000-2017 (detailed in Fig. 3). In addition, 35%, 29%, and 36% of the $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ observations were conducted in warmer, cooler, and the whole year, respectively. The seasonal effects of NO_x emissions may not substantially influence the patterns of regional $\delta^{15}N_{w\text{-}NO3-}$ variations.

Differences between $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ and $\delta^{15}N_{i-NOx}$ values. NO is normally insoluble in water, and w-NO₃⁻⁻ is scavenged only from the ambient NO₂ and the oxidized NO_x (i.e., HNO₃ and p-NO₃⁻⁻) (Supplementary Fig. 1)^{32,38,39}. Moreover, isotopic effects during the NO_x cycles lead to differences between $\delta^{15}N_{NOx}$ and $\delta^{15}N_{NOx}$. Therefore, substantial differences exist between the $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ and $\delta^{15}N_{i-NOx}$ values in the atmosphere (hereafter denoted as ${}^{15}\Delta_{i-NOx \rightarrow w-NO3-}$). In this study, we calculated ${}^{15}\Delta_{i-NOx \rightarrow w-NO3-}$ values by using the following equation (Eq. (2)):

$${}^{5}\Delta_{i-NOx \to w-NO3-} = \delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-} - \delta^{15}N_{i-NOx}.$$
 (2)

Combined Eq. (1) with Eq. (2), we get Eq. (3) to calculate the ${}^{15}\Delta_{i\text{-NO}x \to w\text{-NO}3-}$ values.

To obtain more accurate $^{15}\Delta_{i \cdot NOx \rightarrow w \cdot NO3-}$ values, we estimated the $^{15}\Delta_{i \cdot NOx \rightarrow w \cdot NO3-}$ values in two independent scenarios. In Scenario 1, mean values of global $\delta^{15}N_{NOx}$ and f_{NO2} values, simultaneously observed values of ambient $C_{NO2}, C_{HNO3}, C_{p-NO3-}, \delta^{15}N_{HNO3}, \delta^{15}N_{p-NO3-}$, and $\delta^{15}N_{w \cdot NO3-}$ were used for the calculation in Eq. (3). In Scenario 2, non-synchronously observed values of ambient $f_{NO2}, C_{NO2}, C_{NO2}, C_{HNO3}, C_{p-NO3-}, \delta^{15}N_{NOx}, \delta^{15}N_{HNO3}, \delta^{15}N_{p-NO3-}$, and $\delta^{15}N_{w \cdot NO3-}$ were used for the calculation in Eq. (3). The values and data sources of parameters used for estimating ambient $^{15}\Delta_{i \cdot NOx \rightarrow w \cdot NO3-}$ values are included in Supplementary Table 1. Because data of f_{NO2} and $\delta^{15}N_{NOx}$ are very sparse globally, we used global mean values and considered their SD values into the uncertainty analysis by the Monte Carlo method. Furthermore, because of no significant difference between $^{15}\Delta_{i}$. $_{NOx \rightarrow w \cdot NO3-}$ values obtained in Scenario 1 (2.1 \pm 1.7%) and Scenario 2 (5.7 \pm 3.2%) (Supplementary Fig. 2), we used a mean value of them (3.9 \pm 1.8%; Supplementary Fig. 2) in the calculations of source contributions (Eqs. (4) and (5)).

Contributions of dominant fossil fuel and non-fossil fuel NO_x **sources**. Based on $\delta^{15}N_{w\cdot NO3-}$, $^{15}\Delta_{i\cdot NOx \rightarrow w\cdot NO3-}$, and $\delta^{15}N$ values of NO_x sources, we estimated relative contributions of dominant fossil fuel and non-fossil fuel NO_x sources to total NO_x emissions by using the isotope mass-balance method. We considered coal combustion (denoted as S1) and vehicle exhausts (S2) as dominant fossil fuel NO_x sources, and biomass burning (S3), and microbial N cycles (S4) as dominant non-fossil fuel NO_x sources. The major reasons include: (1) these four sources have been considered as dominant sources of total NO_x emissions in studies of both emission inventory and deposition modeling^{2,9,11,13-15,19-21}; (2) they are also the dominant sources influencing $\delta^{15}N$ values of NO_x and NO₃⁻⁻ in the atmosphere;^{26,27} (3) their mean $\delta^{15}N$ values of NO_x emission sources differ significantly (P < 0.05, Supplementary Fig. 3) and therefore can be used to differentiate their relative contributions.

The S1-S4 are considered as dominant NO_x sources at urban sites but S2 cannot be considered as a dominant NOx source at non-urban sites. First of all, studies of roadside NO_x emissions have evidenced that vehicle exhausts contribute little to atmospheric NOx at non-urban sites due to limited amounts of long-range transport⁴⁰⁻⁴². Statistical data also show 76%, 82%, and 78% of vehicles distributed in urban areas of East Asia, North America, and Europe, respectively while their urban areas account for only 1.7%, 1.4%, and 16.6% of total land area, respectively (Supplementary Tables 2, 3, Supplementary Fig. 12). Secondly, 76% and 91% of $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$ values at urban and non-urban sites fall in the $\delta^{15}N$ range of NO_x from vehicle exhausts (Supplementary Figs. 3, 13). Consequently, when the NO_x from vehicle exhausts is considered into the calculations of relative contributions of different NOx sources at non-urban sites, its contributions at non-urban sites (25 ± 12%) are similar to urban sites ($28 \pm 8\%$), which is unlikely. Besides, because mutual NO_x transportations always occur between urban and non-urban areas, δ^{15} N values of NO₃⁻ in precipitation at a given urban or non-urban site integrate δ^{15} N values of NO_x from both local emissions and regional transportations. However, physical NO_x transportation might have no substantial isotope effects, and thus likely will not influence the site-specific evaluations of fossil and nonfossil fuel NO_x contributions.

According to isotope mass-balance theory, we calculated relative contributions of S1–S4 (f_{S1} , f_{S2} , f_{S3} , and f_{S4} , respectively) at urban sites by using Eq. (4):

$$\begin{split} \delta^{15} \mathrm{N}_{\mathrm{w-NO3-}} = & (f_{S1} \times \delta^{15} \mathrm{N}_{S1} + f_{S2} \times \delta^{15} \mathrm{N}_{S2} + f_{S3} \times \delta^{15} \mathrm{N}_{S3} + f_{S4} \times \delta^{15} \mathrm{N}_{S4}) \\ &+ {}^{15} \Delta_{\mathrm{i-NOX-w-NO3-}}, \end{split}$$

where we assumed that $f_{S1} + f_{S2} + f_{S3} + f_{S4} = 1$. Then, we calculated their relative contributions at non-urban sites by Eq. (5):

$$\delta^{15} \mathbf{N}_{w-NO3-} = (f_{S1} \times \delta^{15} \mathbf{N}_{S1} + f_{S3} \times \delta^{15} \mathbf{N}_{S3} + f_{S4} \times \delta^{15} \mathbf{N}_{S4}) + {}^{15} \Delta_{i} \times \mathbf{NO3} \quad (5)$$

where we assumed that $f_{S1} + f_{S3} + f_{S4} = 1$. $\delta^{15}N_{S1}$, $\delta^{15}N_{S2}$, $\delta^{15}N_{S3}$, and $\delta^{15}N_{S4}$ represent $\delta^{15}N$ values of NO_x from coal combustion (S1), vehicle exhausts (S2), biomass burning (S3), and microbial N cycles (S4), respectively (Supplementary Fig. 3).

The f_{S1} , f_{S2} , f_{S3} , and f_{S4} values were calculated by using a Bayesian isotope-mixing model (named Stable Isotope Analysis in R, SIAR). The SIAR model⁴³ uses a Bayesian framework to establish a logical prior distribution based on Dirichlet distribution⁴⁴ for estimating source contributions ($f_{S1}-f_{S4}$). It has the potential to provide reliable estimations of source contributions because the isotope effect (i.e., $^{15}\Delta_{i-NOX-W-NO3-}$ values in this study), the variability in $\delta^{15}N$ values of both sources (i.e., $\delta^{15}N$ values of NO_x from S1–S4 in this study), and the mixture (i.e., $\delta^{15}N_{W-NO3-}$ values in this study) ^{45,46} are considered. The SIAR model has been widely used to quantify the relative contributions of multiple NO_x emission sources to p-NO₃⁻⁻ and w-NO₃^{--26,27,31,47}. In each run of the SIAR model, the mean \pm SD of $\delta^{15}N_{NOx}$ values (Supplementary Fig. 3), the mean \pm SD of $^{15}\Delta_{W-NO3--H-NOx}$ values (Supplementary Fig. 2), and replicate $\delta^{15}N_{W-NO3-}$ values at each urban or non-urban site in each sampling year (Fig. 3) were input into the model. In addition, the percentage data of each source (n = 10,000) output from each run of the SIAR model were used to calculate mean \pm SD values of corresponding source contributions (Supplementary Fig. 5–8).

We calculated the total contribution of each NO_x source in each region (*F*; Eq. (6)) by using its annual mean relative contributions at urban and non-urban sites during 2000–2017 (n = 28, 9, 13 for urban sites and n = 47, 21, 88 for non-urban sites in East Asia, Europe, and North America, respectively) (f_{urban} and $f_{non-urban}$, respectively; Supplementary Fig. 9) and annual mean proportions of urban and non-urban populations in the total population of each region during 2000–2017 (P_{urban} and $P_{non-urban}$, respectively; Supplementary Fig. 14).

$$F = f_{\rm urban} \times P_{\rm urban} \times f_{\rm non-urban} \times P_{\rm non-urban}.$$
 (6)

Then, we calculated annual mean relative contributions of dominant fossil fuel and non-fossil fuel NO_x sources in each region (F_{fossil} and $F_{\text{non-fossib}}$ respectively) by using Eq. (7) and Eq. (8), respectively.

$$F_{\text{fossil}} = F_{\text{S1}} + F_{\text{S2}}, \qquad (7)$$

$$F_{\rm non-fossil} = F_{\rm S3} + F_{\rm S4}.$$
 (8)

Finally, based on the annual mean amounts of fossil fuel NO_x emissions (A_{fossil}) in

East Asia during 2000–2010, in Europe during 2000–2015, and in North America during 2000–2016, respectively (Fig. 4b, Supplementary Fig. 10), the annual mean amounts of total NO_x emissions (A_{total}) and non-fossil fuel NO_x emissions ($A_{non-fossil}$) in each region during 2000–2017 were calculated by using Eq. (9) and Eq. (10), respectively:

$$A_{\rm total} = A_{\rm fossil} / F_{\rm fossil}, \tag{9}$$

10)

$$A_{\rm non-fossil} = A_{\rm total} - A_{\rm fossil}.$$
 (

We estimated the SD values of calculated values in Eqs. (6)–(10) and finally propagated into the uncertainties of the $A_{non-fossil}$ values by using the Monte Carlo method.

Statistical analyses. The one-way analyses of variance (Fig. 2) and Pearson correlation analyses (Fig. 3) were performed by using the Origin 2016 statistical package (OriginLab Corporation, USA) and SPSS 16.0 statistical package (SPSS Inc., Chicago, IL). Because of regionally limiting observation sites and inherently high variability of $\delta^{15}N_{w-NO3-}$, spatial differences are significant only at the level of P < 0.1 (Fig. 2). Mean values and standard deviation (SD) were reported.

Data availability

The data underlying the findings of this study are available in this article. Source data are provided with this paper.

Received: 3 April 2020; Accepted: 24 November 2020; Published online: 11 January 2021

References

- Galloway, J. N. et al. Nitrogen cycles: past, present, and future. *Biogeochemistry* 70, 153–226 (2004).
- Sutton, M. A., Oenema, O., Erisman, J. W., Leip, A. & Winiwarter, W. Too much of a good thing. *Nature* 472, 159–161 (2011).
- Fowler, D. et al. The global nitrogen cycle in the twenty-first century. *Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B.* 368, 20130164 (2013).
- Liu, X. J. et al. Enhanced nitrogen deposition over China. Nature 494, 459–462 (2013).
- Clark, C. M. & Tilman, D. Loss of plant species after chronic low-level nitrogen deposition to prairie grasslands. *Nature* 451, 712–715 (2008).
- Guo, J. H. et al. Significant acidification in major Chinese croplands. Science 327, 1008–1010 (2010).
- 7. Morin, S. et al. Tracing the origin and fate of NO_x in the Arctic atmosphere using stable isotopes in nitrate. *Science* **322**, 730–732 (2008).
- Geng, L. et al. Nitrogen isotopes in ice core nitrate linked to anthropogenic atmospheric acidity change. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. 111, 5808–5812 (2014).
- Richter, A., Burrows, J. P., Nüß, K., Granier, C. & Niemeier, U. Increase in tropospheric nitrogen dioxide over China observed from space. *Nature* 437, 129–132 (2005).
- Ohara, T. et al. An Asian emission inventory of anthropogenic emission sources for the period 1980–2020. Atmos. Chem. Phys. 7, 4419–4444 (2007).
- 11. Anenberg, S. C. et al. Impacts and mitigation of excess diesel-related NO_x emissions in 11 major vehicle markets. *Nature* 545, 467–471 (2017).
- Oberschelp, C., Pfister, S., Raptis, C. E. & Hellweg, S. Global emission hotspots of coal power generation. *Nature Sustain* 2, 113–121 (2019).
- 13. National emission ceilings directive emissions data viewer 1990-2017. Data were downloaded from https://www.eea.europa.eu/data-and-maps/ dashboards/necd-directive-data-viewer-2.
- 14. Air pollutant emissions trends data. Data were downloaded from https://www.epa.gov/air-emissions-inventories/air-pollutant-emissions-trends-data.
- 15. Air pollutants emissions inventory online search. Data were downloaded from https://pollution-waste.canada.ca/air-emission-inventory.
- Streets, D. G., Yarber, K. F., Woo, J. H. & Carmichael, G. R. Biomass burning in Asia: annual and seasonal estimates and atmospheric emissions. *Global Biogeochem. Cycles* 17, 1099 (2003).
- Castellanos, P., Boersma, K. F. & Van, W. G. R. Satellite observations indicate substantial spatiotemporal variability in biomass burning NOx emission factors for South America. *Atmos. Chem. Phys.* 14, 3929–3943 (2014).
- Oikawa, P. Y. et al. Unusually high soil nitrogen oxide emissions influence air quality in a high-temperature agricultural region. *Nat. Commun.* 6, 8753 (2015).
- Martin, R. V. et al. Global inventory of nitrogen oxide emission constrained by space-based observations of NO2 columns. *J. Geophys. Res. Atmos.* 108, 1–12 (2003).
- 20. Jaeglé, L., Steinberger, L., Martin, R. V. & Chance, K. Global partitioning of NOx sources using satellite observations: relative roles of fossil fuel

combustion, biomass burning and soil emissions. Faraday Discuss 130, 407-423 (2005).

- Jain, A. K., Tao, Z., Yang, X. & Gillespie, C. Estimates of global biomass burning emissions for reactive greenhouse gases (CO, NMHCS, and NOx) and CO2. J. Geophys. Res. Atmos. 111, D06304 (2006).
- Almaraz, M., Bai, E., Wang, C., Trousdell, J. & Houlton, B. Z. Agriculture is a major source of NOx pollution in California. *Sci. Adv.* 4, eaao3477 (2018).
- 23. Hoering, T. The isotopic composition of the ammonia and the nitrate ion in rain. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **12**, 97–102 (1957).
- Kendall, C., Elliott, E. M. & Wankel, S. D. in *Stable Isotopes in Ecology and Environmental Science* 2nd edn (eds Michener, R. M., Lajtha, K.) 375–449 (Blackwell, Oxford, 2007).
- Gobel, A. R., Altieri, K. E., Peters, A. J., Hastings, M. G. & Sigman, D. M. Insights into anthropogenic nitrogen deposition to the North Atlantic investigated using the isotopic composition of aerosol and rainwater nitrate. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **40**, 5977–5982 (2013).
- Zong, Z. et al. First assessment of NO_x sources at a regional background site in North China using isotopic analysis linked with modeling. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 51, 5923–5931 (2017).
- Song, W. et al. Isotopic evaluation on relative contributions of major NO_x sources to nitrate of PM_{2.5} in Beijing. *Environ. Pollut.* 248, 183–190 (2019).
- Ye, C. X. et al. Rapid cycling of reactive nitrogen in the marine boundary layer. Nature 532, 489–491 (2016).
- Freyer, H. D., Kley, D., Volz-Thomas, A. & Kobel, K. On the interaction of isotopic exchange processes with photochemical reactions in atmospheric oxides of nitrogen. *J. Geophy. Res. Atmos.* 98, 14791–14796 (1993).
- Walters, W. W. & Michalski, G. Theoretical calculation of nitrogen isotope equilibrium exchange fractionation factors for various NOy molecules. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 164, 284–297 (2015).
- Liu, X. Y., Yin, Y. M. & Song, W. Nitrogen isotope differences between major atmospheric NOy species: Implications for transformation and deposition processes. *Environ. Sci. Technol. Lett.* 7, 227–233 (2020).
- 32. Liu, X. Y. et al. Stable isotope analyses of precipitation nitrogen sources in Guiyang, Southwestern China. *Environ. Pollut.* **230**, 486–494 (2017).
- Dong, J. & Zhang, J. Composite evaluation of replacing small generation units with large ones in the electricity sector in China. In 2008 International Conference on Risk Management & Engineering Management, Beijing pp. 195–201. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICRMEM.2008.59 (2008).
- Zhu, F. H. & Zhao, G. H. Regulations and practice on flue gas denitrification for coal-fired power plants in China. *Electricity* 19, 53–56 (2008).
- Zhang, Q., Ma, R., Xu, Y. N., Shi, J. R. & Guan, F. Y. Comparison and analysis on flue gas denitrification technology in coal fired boiler retrofit. *Adv. Mater. Res.* 781, 2497–2501 (2013).
- Felix, J. D., Elliott, E. M. & Shaw, S. L. The isotopic composition of coal-fired power plant NO_x: the influence of emission controls and implications for global emission inventories. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 46, 3528–3535 (2012).
- Rohatgi, A. WebPlotDigitalizer: HTML5 based online tool to extract numerical data from plot images. Version 4.2. https://automeris.io/ WebPlotDigitizer/index.html (accessed on April 2019) (2019).
- Barrie, L. A. Scavenging ratios, wet deposition, and in-cloud oxidation: an application to the oxides of sulphur and nitrogen. J. Geophys. Res. Atmos. 90, https://doi.org/10.1029/JD090iD03p05789 (1985).
- Cheng, I. & Zhang, L. M. Long-term air concentrations, wet deposition, and scavenging ratios of inorganic ions, HNO3 and SO2 and assessment of aerosol and precipitation acidity at canadian rural locations. *Atmos. Chem. Phys.* 17, 1–42 (2017).
- Yao, Z., Huo, H., Zhang, Q., Streets, D. G. & He, K. Gaseous and particulate emissions from rural vehicles in China. *Atmos. Environ.* 45, 3055–3061 (2011).
- Miller, D. J., Wojtal, P. K., Clark, S. C. & Hastings, M. G. Vehicle NO_x emission plume isotopic signatures: spatial variability across the eastern United States. *J. Geophys. Res. Atmos.* **122**, https://doi.org/10.1002/ 2016JD025877 (2017).
- Yang, D. et al. High-resolution mapping of vehicle emissions of atmospheric pollutants based on large-scale, real-world traffic datasets. *Atmos. Chem. Phys.* 19, 8831–8843 (2019).
- Parnell, A. C., Inger, R., Bearhop, S. & Jackson, A. L. Source partitioning using stable isotopes: coping with too much variation. *PLoS ONE* 5, e9672 (2010).
- Evans, J. S. B. T., Handley, S. J., Perham, N., Over, D. E. & Thompson, V. A. Frequency versus probability formats in statistical word problems. *Cognition*. 77, 197–213 (2000).
- Moore, J. W. & Semmens, B. X. Incorporating uncertainty and prior information into stable isotope mixing models. *Ecol. Lett.* 11, 470–480 (2008).

- Liu, X. Y. et al. Nitrate is an important nitrogen source for Arctic tundra plants. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. 115, 3398–3403 (2018).
- Song, W. et al. Nitrogen isotope differences between atmospheric nitrate and corresponding nitrogen oxides: a new constraint using oxygen isotopes. *Sci. Total Environ.* **701**, 134515 (2020).

Acknowledgements

This study was supported by the State Key Project of Research and Development Plan (2017YFC0210101, 2016YFA0600802), the National Natural Science Foundation of China (Nos. 41730855, 41522301, 42073005), the Outstanding Youth Funds of Tianjin (No. 17JCJQJC45400), the Coordinated Research Project of IAEA (F32008), Shenzhen Science and Technology Program (KQTD20180413181724653), and the 11th Recruitment Program of Global Experts (the Thousand Talents Plan) for Young Professionals granted by the central budget of China. We would like to gratefully thank all researchers and isotopes of atmospheric NO₂₅ HNO₃, and NO₃⁻⁻.

Author contributions

X.-Y.L. designed the research. W.S., X.-Y.L., C.-C.H. conducted the research (data collections and analyses). W.S. and X.-Y.L. co-wrote the paper, G.-Y.C., X.-J.L., W.W.W., G.M. and C.-Q.L. commented on the manuscript.

Competing interests

The authors declare no competing interests.

Additional information

Supplementary information is available for this paper at https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-20356-0.

Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to X.-Y.L.

Peer review information Nature Communications thanks David Fowler, Shaoneng He, and Xuemei Wang for their contribution to the peer review of this work

Reprints and permission information is available at http://www.nature.com/reprints

Publisher's note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Open Access This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/ licenses/by/4.0/.

© The Author(s) 2021